

**REPORT
OF THE EXTERNAL EVALUATION COMMISSION
ON THE RESULTS OF COMPLIANCE ASSESSMENT
OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME IN 0301000 "MEDICAL CARE"
OF THE STATE-OWNED MUNICIPAL ENTERPRISE ON THE REM
"HIGHER MEDICAL COLLEGE" OF THE ALMATY PUBLIC HEALTH
DEPARTMENT WITH THE STANDARDS FOR SPECIALIZED
ACCREDITATION**

1. Composition of the External Evaluation Commission

In accordance with the ECAQA order No.27 dated 11.03.2019, the External Evaluation Commission (EEC) was formed to conduct specialized accreditation of the educational programme in 0301000 "Medical Care" of the State-Owned Municipal Enterprise on the REM "Higher Medical College" of the Almaty Public Health Department with the following composition:



The Chairperson of the EEC

Gulmira Telmanovna Tokbergenova,
Candidate of Pedagogic Sciences,
Director of the Medical College "Interdent"



Foreign Expert

Tamara Sultanovna Saktaganova
International Educational Holding "Gaudeamus",
Member of the International Society of Honorary Nurses
"Sigma Theta Tau", Honoured Health Worker of the
Kyrgyz Republic



National academic expert

Irina Vladimirovna Kadysheva
Deputy Director for training and production work, Higher
Medical College of Astana Akimat



National academic expert

Elmira Amankulovna Kozhabayeva
Director of the Abu Ali Ibn Sina Higher Medical College
LLP, Turkestan region, Saryagash



National academic expert

Altnai Baltabayevna Kumarova
Deputy Director for teaching and educational work of the
State-owned Municipal Enterprise on the Right of
Economic Management “Taldykorgan Higher Medical
College”



National academic expert

Karlygash Amangeldiyevna Yestemesova,
Candidate of Biological Sciences, Associate Professor,
Dean of the School of Nursing Education, Karaganda
State Medical University



National academic expert

Tatyana Kadyrovna Amanzholova
Deputy Director for practical training of the non-state
educational institution “Kazakh-Russian Medical
College”



Expert-student

Diana Sergeyevna Bryuzgina, 4th-year-student in
Nursing, Republican Higher Medical College



**Expert- Representative of Practical
Health Care**

Zagira Alipbayevna Shukurgaliyeva
Deputy Chief Physician for Nursing, State-owned
Municipal Enterprise on the Right of Economic
Management “City Cardiology Center”, Almaty



ECAQA Observer

Makpal Aldibekovna Umarova Eurasian
Centre for Accreditation and Quality
Assurance in Higher Education and
Health Care, Head of the Accreditation
and Monitoring Department

During the period from March 27 to March 28, 2019, the assessment of compliance of the main activities on the educational programme in 0301000 "Medical Care" of the State-owned Municipal Enterprise on the REM "Higher Medical College" of the Almaty Public Health Department (hereinafter HMC) with the ECAQA Standards for Specialized Accreditation was made.

The EEC report contains the assessment of the educational programme in 0301000 "Medical Care" of the State-owned Municipal Enterprise on the REM "Higher Medical College" of the Almaty Public Health Department for compliance with the ECAQA Standards for Specialized Accreditation, and the EEC recommendations on further improvement of the activities/implementation of the educational programme.

2. General Part of the EEC Final Report

Presentation of the medical education organisation

The State-owned Municipal Enterprise on the REM "Higher Medical College" of the Almaty Public Health Department was founded in 1981 as the Almaty Medical Training School according to the Order No. 141 dated 12.03.1981 of the Ministry of Health of the Kazakh Soviet Socialist Republic "In order to improve the staffing level of health care facilities in Almaty through providing secondary health personnel." The college carries out educational activities on the basis of a state license for the right to conduct educational activities issued by the Department for Education Control in Almaty, the Committee for Control of Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 20.09.2018 No.KZ08LAA00012861 (initial issuance dated 07.11.2011) on the educational programme in 0301000 "Medical Care" with qualifications in 0301013 "Physician Assistant", 0301023 "Obstetrician".

2004 - The faculty of continuing education was created.

2007 - The faculty continuing education was reorganized into the "Centre for Postgraduate Education of Nursing Specialists".

2015 - The Health Department introduced new aspects of monitoring and auditing of the nursing service of Almaty, for that matter, the "Almaty Nursing Development Centre" was established on the basis of the Medical College.

By the resolution of the Akim (mayor) of Almaty No. 4/701 dated December 29, 2015, and the order of the Bostandyk District Department of Justice of the Almaty Department of Justice No. 2428 dated July 14, 2016, the "City Hospital of Nursing Care" was added to the college structure as its own clinical setting.

2016 - by the Order of the Head of the Almaty Health Department, the "Nursing Service Development Centre" was reorganized into the "Training Centre of the Almaty Public Health Department".

In 2018, by the Resolution of the Almaty Akimat (local administration) dated June 6, 2018 No. 2/285, the college was renamed as the Higher Medical College of the Almaty Public Health Department.

The college is located in a standardized building, the total area of all the rooms used to organize the educational process is 5769.3 sq.m.

The education in "Medical Care" is carried out on a budgetary and a fee-paying basis. The language of instruction is Kazakh, Russian.

To date, the number of students in “Medical Care” educational programme is: “Physician Assistant” qualification – 509 people, “Obstetrician” – 74. In the academic year 2018 - 2019, the total number of educators was 130, consisting of 111 full-time (85.4%) and 19 part-time educators (14.6%). Out of the total number of educators, there are: 31 (27.9%) with the highest qualification grade, 11 (9.9%) with the first qualification grade, and 33 (29.7%) with the second qualification grade.

The college plans to introduce the educational programme of applied Bachelor’s degree and the first admission of students for the 2019-2020 academic years.

3. Analysis of compliance with the Standards for Specialized Accreditation based on the results of the external evaluation of the educational programme in 0301000 “Medical Care” and the review of strengths in each standard

Standard 1: Mission and Outcomes

The college has a clearly defined Mission. The Mission and Vision are available on the college website www.medcollege.kz. Stakeholders participated in the discussion of the Mission. The 2018-2022 Strategic Plan has been developed. The Code of Business Conduct and the Student Conduct Statute have been introduced. It is planned to introduce an applied bachelor’s degree programme and the first admission of students for the 2019-2020 academic year. The employment of graduates in 2018 amounted to 74.1%, 21% entered the university. Customer satisfaction with the quality of college training was 74.8%.

Strengths:

- Mission and Vision have been identified with the participation of stakeholders;*
- The 2018-2022 Strategic Plan has been developed taking into account the requirements of the national economy and labour market;*
- Satisfaction of employers with the quality of training amounts to 74.8%;*
- It is planned to introduce an applied bachelor's degree programme;*
- Information on the mission, vision and goals of the HMC is available to all stakeholders on the college website www.medcollege.kz.*

The EEC conclusions on the criteria: comply - 9, partially comply - 0, do not comply - 0.

Standard 1: accomplished

Recommendations for improvement:

- To active involvement of stakeholders, namely students and employers, in the consideration of the college Mission, taking into account the assessment of the competitive environment and modern requirements of the labour market;*
- To further develop international cooperation.*

Standard 2: Educational programme

The educational activities of the college in 0301000 “Medical Care” are carried out in accordance with the 2016 State Compulsory Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan, standard and working curricula, consistent with the mission, goals and objectives of the HMC Strategic Plan. The educational process uses innovative

technologies (critical thinking, case studies, role-playing games, and the project method), simulation technologies, a “standardized patient”, clinical case scenarios. The analysis of the quality of academic performance over three years based on the results of midterm assessment of the courses shows a stable positive trend.

The discipline determined by the educational organisation on the topic “Basic Life Support” for graduates is defined. The college has its own clinical setting: the city hospital of nursing care with 100 beds, where workshop practice for students is conducted. Agreements were also concluded with 41 medical organisations to organize work placement. Satisfaction with the organisation of practical training is 100%.

Strengths:

- The presence of own clinical setting for the organisation of practical training;*
- Assessment of student satisfaction with the level of educational services and the quality of practical training;*
- Assessment of employer satisfaction with the quality of graduate training through a survey of heads of medical organisations (74.8%);*
- Definition of the discipline determined by the educational organisation on the topic “Basic Life Support” for graduates*
- Close connection with practical health care.*

The EEC conclusions on the criteria: comply - 12, partially comply - 2, do not comply - 0.

Standard 2: accomplished

Recommendations for improvement:

- To implement dual training in the "Medical Care" educational programme;*
- To include the disciplines determined by the educational organisation and electives taking into account the requirements of the healthcare system of the region;*
- To activate involvement of employers in the revision of the educational programme;*
- To activate student involvement in scientific research work of students in special disciplines.*

Standard 3: Assessment

Assessment of student learning is carried out according to the traditional system. Student information about the grading system begins with the “Student Guidebook” and is carried out by educators, curators, and via information boards. The current college grading system is presented. Students are informed about the criteria for assessments at the midterm assessment, grading tests, at the stages of the Final state attestation (IGA). Within three years, the academic performance indicator in “Medical Care” is 100%. 65% of student passed the Independent Quality Assessment (NOK) examination at the first attempt. The Final state attestation is conducted with the participation of practitioners of public health. The results of the quality of knowledge in "Medical Care" following the results of the 2017-2018 Final state attestation amounted to 96.5%. Consumer satisfaction with the training level of graduates is 74.8%.

Strengths:

-Stable results of academic performance and quality of knowledge of "Medical Care" graduates following the results of the Final state attestation;

-Introduction of the Objective Structured Clinical Examination (OSCE) into the educational process;

-Availability of feedback from employers.

The EEC conclusions on the criteria: comply - 5, partially comply - 0, do not comply - 0.

Standard 3: accomplished

Recommendations for improvement:

-To develop assessment procedures focused on learning outcomes.

Standard 4: Students

The number of students in the specialties for the 2018-2019 academic years is 583 where 471 are taught in the state language of instruction. Social-psychological support is provided for students, including disadvantaged groups. The First Year Adaptation Programme has been developed to preserve the psychological health of first-year-students. 352 students have participated in the programme. The "Regulation on social support for students of the Higher Medical College of the PHD of Almaty" has been developed.

The college is working on creating the conditions for students' creativity (12 students' scientific research circles, 5 of them are in clinical disciplines, an English club, the "Adrenalin" team of the Club for the Lightheaded and Quick-witted (KVN), a volunteer movement). The employment of graduates in 2018 amounted to 74.1%, 21% entered the university.

Strengths:

-Presence of social-psychological support for students, including disadvantaged groups;

-Creation of conditions for creativity and personal growth of students;

-Stable graduate employment rates over the past 3 years.

The EEC conclusions on the criteria: comply - 12, partially comply - 0, do not comply - 0.

Standard 4: accomplished

Recommendations for improvement:

-To advance allocation mechanism and graduate employment procedure.

Standard 5: Academic Staff/Faculty

The college is provided with qualified teaching staff. In the 2018-2019 academic years, the total number of educators was **130**, among them the number of full-time educators was **111 (85.4%)**, and the number of part-time educators was 19 (14.6%). Out of the total number of educators, there are: 31 (27.9%) with the highest qualification grade, 11 (9.9%) with the first qualification grade, 33 (29.7%) with the second qualification grade.

The Quality Management System has been implemented. The Centre for simulation technologies and quality monitoring of education is in operation. The Regulation on "The criteria for assessment of educator performance" has been developed; the monitoring results are taken into account when determining educator academic load and educator incentive. Monitoring satisfaction with the quality of educational services provided by educators is carried out by studying the opinions of consumers (students) through questionnaires. The monitoring results are attached to the self-assessment report. There is the educator personal development curriculum, the Professional Development Long-Term Plan (74 educators were trained in 2018). Educators also carry out students' scientific research and publishing activities (there have been 100 publications at the republican level, 19 publications at the international level for 3 years). 5 special disciplines circles are in operation.

Strengths:

- The Quality Management System ISO 9001: 2016 has been introduced;*
- The Centre for simulation technologies and quality monitoring of education is in operation;*
- Pedagogical capacity building of educators, including foreign education;*
- Participation of educators in the development and publication of analytical, methodical literature;*
- Stimulation and motivation of the teaching staff.*

The EEC conclusions on the criteria: comply - 4, partially comply - 0, do not comply - 0.

Standard 5: *accomplished*

Recommendations for improvement:

- To activate involvement of the faculty of special disciplines in students' scientific research.*

Standard 6: Educational resources

The college has a modern material and technical base: an education building with a total area of 5769.3 sq.m., including an assembly hall with an area of 405.8 sq.m. with 130 seats, a dining room with 85 seats, a library with a total area of 151 sq.m. (consisting of a delivery desk, a reading room with 24 seats, and a library stack). The book fund of the library has 47,250 copies. The "KABIS" system has been implemented to comprehensively automate library processes and the creation of electronic catalogues, as well as full-text databases.

Academic studies at the college are held in 62 study rooms and laboratories, 20 study rooms are located in medical organisations, 6 rooms of information technologies are in operation. The equipment is 86%. The college has its own clinic: a city hospital for nursing care with 100 beds. The college has one broadband Internet connection with a total speed of 150 Mbps. The Simulation Centre is in operation.

Strengths:

- Existence of own clinic;*
- Availability of the Simulation Centre equipped with modern simulation mannequins for developing practical skills;*

-Developed material and technical base of the Training Centre (Department of Professional Development and Retraining of Healthcare Specialists);

-Evaluation of the development dynamics of material and technical resources.

The EEC conclusions on the criteria: comply - 9, partially comply - 2, do not comply - 0.

Standard 6: accomplished

Recommendations for improvement:

-To develop information resources of the educational process (via introducing interactive whiteboards, computer programmes);

-To continue updating the college material and technical base with sports equipment, training simulators in special disciplines.

Standard 7: Programme Evaluation

Evaluation of educational programmes is carried out based on the results of student performance and quality of knowledge, data on monitoring satisfaction of students, faculty and employers, as well as student achievements. Educational programme assessment is carried out by monitoring consumer satisfaction through questionnaires, interviews, sociological surveys, monitoring the quality of knowledge in moving fashion. Students' achievements, analysis of monitoring student satisfaction are well presented. Questionnaires for students, faculty, and employers have been developed. 1328 students participated in the questionnaire regarding monitoring student satisfaction with the educational process, which amounted to 95.8% of the total number of college students.

The results of the educational programme assessment are analyzed and considered at meetings of the Education Board, the Educators Council; decisions are made to improve the educational process.

Strengths:

-Systematic monitoring of the educational programme assessment of students' satisfaction with their educational level;

-Satisfaction of employers with the training quality of college graduates.

The EEC conclusions on the criteria: comply - 9, partially comply - 0, do not comply - 0.

Standard 7: accomplished

Recommendations for improvement:

-To develop the educational programme assessment based on feedback from consumers (students and employers) and on learning outcomes (independent quality assessment).

Standard 8. Governance and administration

The organisational structure of the college reflects the horizontal and vertical structure of Departments, which contributes to the achievement of the Mission, goals and objectives of the "Higher Medical College" of the PHD of Almaty. The organisational structure reflects the following: Director, Educators Council; Board of

Trustees, Student Council; Deputy Director for studies and educational work; Deputy Director for Clinical Services of the hospital of nursing care; Head of the Training Centre; Finance and Economy Department; Human Resource Management Department; Legal Expert; Maintenance Department; Department of Educational and Social Work; Academic Office; Office of Government Procurement; Scientific and Methodological Department; Education Board; Information Technologies Support Department; Simulation Centre; Head Educators Board; Testing Centre; Health and Safety Department; Library; Archive; Aid Post.

Strengths:

- Развитие корпоративной культуры колледжа.*
- Building Management on the principles of the Quality Management System;*
- Conformity of the organisational and staff structure to the Quality Policy;*
- Development of the college organisational culture.*

The EEC conclusions on the criteria: comply - 9, partially comply - 0, do not comply - 0.

Standard 8: *accomplished*

Recommendations for improvement:

-To develop ACS (automated control system, electronic document management, curriculum user account)

Standard 9. Continuous renewal

The objectives of the college Strategic Plan are updated taking into account changes in the needs of health care, transformations in society and the health care system. Planning is carried out according to the results of monitoring the existing needs of the college, taking into account the analysis of current activities, the evaluation of educational programmes and the adoption of corrective measures, in terms of reforms in education and healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the employer demands. In 2018, the Centre for psychological relief and communication skills was created based on the monitoring results. The special modular programme for adapting first-year-students and the programme for graduating students “Professional interaction of a future specialist with a patient” have been developed at the Centre. The Simulation Centre has been opened to improve the formation of students’ practical skills. The Objective Structured Clinical Examination (OSCE) has been implemented. The independent assessment of knowledge and skills is carried out at the Centre using the OSCE by independent experts.

Strengths:

- *Systematic activity analysis of all structural units;*
- *Systematic assessment of educational services.*

The EEC conclusions on the criteria: comply - 7, partially comply - 0, do not comply - 0.



Standard 9: *accomplished*

4. Recommendations for improvement of the educational programme in "Medical Care":

1. To actively involve stakeholders, namely students and employers in the consideration of the college Mission, taking into account the assessment of the competitive environment and modern requirements of the labour market;
2. To implement dual training in the "Medical Care" educational programme;
3. To include disciplines defined by the educational organisation and electives taking into account the requirements of the region's health system;
4. To actively involve employers in the revision of the educational programme;
5. To activate the involvement of students in research work in special disciplines;
6. To improve assessment procedures focused on learning outcomes;
7. To improve the allocation mechanism and the graduate employment procedure;
8. To activate involvement of the faculty of special disciplines in students' research work;
9. To improve the educational programme evaluation based on feedback from consumers (students and employers) and on learning outcomes (independent quality assessment).

Рекомендация Аккредитационному совету ЕЦА

Члены ВЭК пришли к единогласному мнению рекомендовать Аккредитационному совету аккредитовать образовательную программу по специальности **0301000 «Лечебное дело», квалификация 0301013 «Фельдшер», 0301023 «Акушер(-ка)»** КГП на ПХВ «Высший медицинский колледж» Управления общественного здоровья города Алматы на период 5 лет.

Председатель ВЭК	Токбергенова Гульмира Тельмановна	
Зарубежный эксперт	Сактанова Тамара Султановна	
Национальный академический эксперт	Кадышева Ирина Владимировна	
Национальный академический эксперт	Кожабаяева Эльмира Аманкуловна	
Национальный академический эксперт	Кумарова Алтынай Балтабаевна	
Национальный академический эксперт	Естемесова Карлыгаш Амангельдиевна	
Национальный академический эксперт	Аманжолова Татьяна Кадыровна	
Эксперт – работодатель	Шукурғалиева Загира Алипбаевна	
Эксперт – слушатель	Брюзгина Диана Сергеевна	
Наблюдатель ВЭК	Умарова Макпал Альдибековна	

[Translation from Russian of the image above]

Recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council

The EEC members unanimously agreed to recommend to the Accreditation Council to accredit the educational programme in **0301000 "Medical Care" with qualifications in 0301013 "Physician Assistant", 0301023 "Obstetrician"** of the State-owned Municipal Enterprise on the REM "Higher Medical College" of the Almaty Public Health Department for a period of 5 years.

The EEC Chairperson	Gulmira Telmanovna Tokbergenova	<i>/signature/</i>
Foreign Expert	Tamara Sultanovna Saktaganova	<i>/signature/</i>
National academic expert	Irina Vladimirovna Kadysheva	<i>/signature/</i>
National academic expert	Elmira Amankulovna Kozhabayeva	<i>/signature/</i>
National academic expert	Altynai Baltabayevna Kumarova	<i>/signature/</i>
National academic expert	Karlygash Amangeldiyevna Yestemesova	<i>/signature/</i>
National academic expert	Tatyana Kadyrovna Amanzholova	<i>/signature/</i>
Expert-Employer	Zagira Alipbayevna Shukurgaliyeva	<i>/signature/</i>
Expert-Trainee	Diana Sergeyeвна Bryuzgina	<i>/signature/</i>
ECAQA Observer	Makpal Aldibekovna Umarova	<i>/signature/</i>

**Quality profile and external evaluation criteria of the educational programme
in 0301000 "Medical Care" of the State-owned Municipal Enterprise on the
REM "Higher Medical College" of the Almaty Public Health Department for
compliance with the Standards for Specialized Accreditation**

Standard	Criteria for assessment	Assessment		
		Comply	Partially comply	Do not comply
1.	Mission and Outcomes	9	0	0
2.	Educational programme	12	2	0
3.	Assessment	5	0	0
4.	Students	12	0	0
5.	Academic Staff/Faculty	4	0	0
6.	Educational resources	9	2	0
7.	Programme Evaluation	9	0	0
8.	Governance and administration	9	0	0
9.	Continuous renewal	7	0	0
	Total	76	4	0